## Math 407: Linear Optimization

General Duality Theory

General Duality Theory

æ







æ

By *more general*, I mean a theory that allows one to compute a dual LP without first having to transform the problem into standard form.

イロン イ団 とく ヨン イヨン

By *more general*, I mean a theory that allows one to compute a dual LP without first having to transform the problem into standard form.

The great advantage of doing this is that it allows the modeler to understand the nature of the dual variables in terms of the original problem statement and the original decision variables.

イロン イ団 とく ヨン イヨン

By *more general*, I mean a theory that allows one to compute a dual LP without first having to transform the problem into standard form.

The great advantage of doing this is that it allows the modeler to understand the nature of the dual variables in terms of the original problem statement and the original decision variables.

In our discussion we still need to make use of a *standard form* but it will be much more general and flexible than the standard form used so far.

### Expanded Standard Form for General Duality Theory

$$\mathcal{P}_G \quad \text{maximize} \quad \sum_{j=1}^n c_j x_j$$
subject to
$$\sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j \le b_i \quad i \in I$$

$$\sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j = b_i \quad i \in E$$

$$0 \le x_j \qquad j \in R \quad .$$

Here the index sets I, E, and R are such that

 $I \cap E = \emptyset$ ,  $I \cup E = \{1, 2, \dots, m\}$ , and  $R \subset \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ .

æ

In the Primal	In the Dual
Maximization	

In the Primal	In the Dual
Maximization	Minimization

In the Primal	In the Dual
Maximization	Minimization
Inequality Constraints	

In the Primal	In the Dual
Maximization	Minimization
Inequality Constraints	Restricted Variables

In the Primal	In the Dual
Maximization	Minimization
Inequality Constraints	Restricted Variables
Equality Constraints	

In the Primal	In the Dual			
in the r rinar				
Maximization	Minimization			
Inequality Constraints	Restricted Variables			
Equality Constraints	Free Variables			

In the Primal	In the Dual
Maximization	Minimization
Inequality Constraints	Restricted Variables
Equality Constraints	Free Variables
Restricted Variables	

In the Primal	In the Dual				
Maximization	Minimization				
Inequality Constraints	Restricted Variables				
Equality Constraints	Free Variables				
Restricted Variables	Inequality Constraints				

In the Primal	In the Dual				
Maximization	Minimization				
Inequality Constraints	Restricted Variables				
Equality Constraints	Free Variables				
Restricted Variables	Inequality Constraints				
Free Variables					

In the Primal	In the Dual			
Maximization	Minimization			
Inequality Constraints	Restricted Variables			
Equality Constraints	Free Variables			
Restricted Variables	Inequality Constraints			
Free Variables	Equality Constraints			

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mathcal{P}_{\mathcal{G}} & \text{maximize} & \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{j} x_{j} \\ & \text{subject to} & \sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij} x_{j} \leq b_{i} & i \in I \\ & \sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij} x_{j} = b_{i} & i \in E \\ & 0 \leq x_{j} & j \in R \end{array}$$

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mathcal{P}_G & \text{maximize} & \sum_{j=1}^n c_j x_j \\ & \text{subject to} & \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j \leq b_i & i \in I \\ & \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j = b_i & i \in E \\ & 0 \leq x_j & j \in R \end{array}$$

 $F = \{1, 2, \ldots, n\} \setminus R$  = the free variables.

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mathcal{P}_{G} & \text{maximize} & \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{j} x_{j} \\ & \text{subject to} & \sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij} x_{j} \leq b_{i} & i \in I \\ & \sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij} x_{j} = b_{i} & i \in E \\ & 0 \leq x_{i} & j \in R \end{array}$$

 $F = \{1, 2, \ldots, n\} \setminus R$  = the free variables.

$$\mathcal{D}_{G}$$
 minimize  $\sum_{i=1}^{m} b_{i} y_{i}$ 

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \mathcal{P}_G & \text{maximize} & \sum_{j=1}^n c_j x_j \\ & \text{subject to} & \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j \leq b_i & i \in I \\ & \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j = b_i & i \in E \\ & 0 \leq x_j & j \in R \end{array}$$

 $F = \{1, 2, \ldots, n\} \setminus R$  = the free variables.

$$\mathcal{D}_G \quad \text{minimize} \quad \sum_{i=1}^m b_i y_i \\ \text{subject to} \quad \sum_{i=1}^m a_{ij} y_i \ge c_j \quad j \in R \\ \sum_{i=1}^m a_{ij} y_i = c_j \quad j \in F$$

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \mathcal{P}_G & \text{maximize} & \sum_{j=1}^n c_j x_j \\ & \text{subject to} & \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j \leq b_i & i \in I \\ & \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j = b_i & i \in E \\ & 0 \leq x_j & j \in R \end{array}$$

 $F = \{1, 2, \ldots, n\} \setminus R$  = the free variables.

$$\mathcal{D}_{G} \quad \text{minimize} \quad \sum_{i=1}^{m} b_{i} y_{i}$$
subject to
$$\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij} y_{i} \ge c_{j} \quad j \in R$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij} y_{i} = c_{j} \quad j \in F$$

$$0 \le y_{i} \qquad i \in I$$

#### Example: General Duality

Compute the dual of the LP

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \text{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 \leq 10, \ 0 \leq x_3 \end{array}$$

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 \leq 10, \ 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad y_1 \geq 0$$

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 \leq 10, \ 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad y_1 \geq 0 \\ \mbox{y_2 free} \\ \end{array}$$

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad y_1 \geq 0 \\ \mbox{y}_2 \mbox{ free} \mbox{y}_2 \mbox{free} \\ \mbox{y}_2 \mbox{free} \mbox{free} \mbox{y}_2 \mbox{free} \mbox{f$$

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{lll} y_1 \geq 0 \\ y_2 \ \mbox{free} \\ y_3 \geq 0 \\ & 0 \end{array}$$

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{lll} y_1 \geq 0 \\ y_2 \ \mbox{free} \\ y_3 \geq 0 \\ & 0 \end{array}$$

minimize

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{lll} y_1 \geq 0 \\ y_2 \ \mbox{free} \\ y_3 \geq 0 \\ & 0 \end{array}$$

minimize

#### $0\leq y_1,\ 0\leq y_3$

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{lll} y_1 \geq 0 \\ y_2 \ \mbox{free} \\ y_3 \geq 0 \\ & 0 \end{array}$$

minimize  $8y_1 + 10y_2 + 10y_3$ 

 $0\leq y_1,\ 0\leq y_3$ 

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{lll} y_1 \geq 0 \\ y_2 \ \mbox{free} \\ y_3 \geq 0 \\ \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{minimize} & 8y_1 + 10y_2 + 10y_3 \\ \text{subject to} & \end{array}$$

 $0 \leq y_1, \ 0 \leq y_3$ 

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{lll} y_1 \geq 0 \\ y_2 \ \mbox{free} \\ y_3 \geq 0 \\ \end{array}$$

minimize 
$$8y_1 + 10y_2 + 10y_3$$
  
subject to  $5y_1 - y_2 + y_3 = 1$ 

 $0 \leq y_1, \ 0 \leq y_3$ 

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{lll} y_1 \geq 0 \\ y_2 \ \mbox{free} \\ y_3 \geq 0 \\ \end{array}$$

minimize 
$$8y_1 + 10y_2 + 10y_3$$
  
subject to  $5y_1 - y_2 + y_3 = 1$   
 $y_1 + 5y_2 = -2$   
 $0 \le y_1, \ 0 \le y_3$ 

2

$$\begin{array}{lll} \mbox{maximize} & x_1 - 2x_2 + 3x_3 \\ \mbox{subject to} & 5x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3 & \leq 8 \\ & -x_1 + 5x_2 + 8x_3 & = 10 \\ & x_1 & \leq 10 \\ & 0 \leq x_3 \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{lll} y_1 \geq 0 \\ y_2 \ \mbox{free} \\ y_3 \geq 0 \\ \end{array}$$

2

maximize	$2x_1$	—	3 <i>x</i> <sub>2</sub>	+	<i>x</i> 3		
subject to	<i>x</i> <sub>1</sub>	+	5 <i>x</i> <sub>2</sub>	_	2 <i>x</i> <sub>3</sub>	=	4
	10 <i>x</i> <sub>1</sub>	+	<i>x</i> <sub>2</sub>	_	5 <i>x</i> 3	$\leq$	20
	5 <i>x</i> 1	_	<i>x</i> <sub>2</sub>	_	<i>x</i> 3	=	3
	$x_1$	$\leq$	6,	0	$\leq$	<i>x</i> <sub>2</sub>	

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ ○臣

#### Primal

Dual

maximize	$2x_1$	$-3x_{2}$	+ .	X3	
subject to	$x_1$	+5	$x_2 - 2$	x <sub>3</sub> =	4
	$10x_1$	+.	$x_2 - 5$	$x_3 \leq$	20
	$5x_1$	—	x <sub>2</sub> –	x <sub>3</sub> =	3
	<i>x</i> <sub>1</sub>	$\leq$	6,	$0 \leq x$	<2×2
minimize	4 <i>y</i> 1	+20 <i>y</i> <sub>2</sub>	+3 <i>y</i> <sub>3</sub>	+6 <i>y</i> <sub>4</sub>	
subject to	$y_1$	$+10y_{2}$	+5 <i>y</i> <sub>3</sub>	$+y_4$	= 2
	5 <i>y</i> 1	$+y_{2}$	$-y_{3}$		$\geq$ -3
-	$-2y_1$	$-5y_{2}$	$-y_{3}$		= 1
	0	$\leq y_2$ ,	0	$\leq y_4$	

$$c^T x \leq y^T A x \leq b^T y.$$

Moreover, the following statements hold.

イロト 不得 トイヨト イヨト

$$c^T x \leq y^T A x \leq b^T y.$$

Moreover, the following statements hold. (i) If  $\mathcal{P}_G$  is unbounded, then  $\mathcal{D}_G$  is infeasible.

1

$$c^T x \leq y^T A x \leq b^T y.$$

Moreover, the following statements hold.

(i) If  $\mathcal{P}_G$  is unbounded, then  $\mathcal{D}_G$  is infeasible.

1

(ii) If  $\mathcal{D}_G$  is unbounded, then  $\mathcal{P}_G$  is infeasible.

< ロ > < 同 > < 三 > < 三 > 、

$$c^T x \leq y^T A x \leq b^T y.$$

Moreover, the following statements hold.

(i) If  $\mathcal{P}_G$  is unbounded, then  $\mathcal{D}_G$  is infeasible.

1

- (ii) If  $\mathcal{D}_G$  is unbounded, then  $\mathcal{P}_G$  is infeasible.
- (iii) If  $\bar{x}$  is feasible for  $\mathcal{P}_G$  and  $\bar{y}$  is feasible for  $\mathcal{D}_G$  with  $c^T \bar{x} = b^T \bar{y}$ , then  $\bar{x}$  is and optimal solution to  $\mathcal{P}_G$  and  $\bar{y}$  is an optimal solution to  $\mathcal{D}_G$ .

< ロ > < 同 > < 三 > < 三 > 、

æ

$$c^T x = \sum_{j \in R} c_j x_j + \sum_{j \in F} c_j x_j$$

æ

$$c^{T}x = \sum_{j \in R} c_{j}x_{j} + \sum_{j \in F} c_{j}x_{j}$$

$$\leq \sum_{j \in R} (\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij}y_{i})x_{j}$$
(Since  $c_{j} \leq \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i}$  and  $x_{j} \geq 0$  for  $j \in R$ 

2

$$c^{T}x = \sum_{j \in R} c_{j}x_{j} + \sum_{j \in F} c_{j}x_{j}$$

$$\leq \sum_{j \in R} (\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij}y_{i})x_{j} + \sum_{j \in F} (\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij}y_{i})x_{j}$$
(Since  $c_{j} \leq \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i}$  and  $x_{j} \geq 0$  for  $j \in R$   
and  $c_{j} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i}$  for  $j \in F$ .)

æ

イロン イ団 とく ヨン イヨン

$$c^{T}x = \sum_{j \in R} c_{j}x_{j} + \sum_{j \in F} c_{j}x_{j}$$

$$\leq \sum_{j \in R} (\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij}y_{i})x_{j} + \sum_{j \in F} (\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij}y_{i})x_{j}$$
(Since  $c_{j} \leq \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i}$  and  $x_{j} \geq 0$  for  $j \in R$   
and  $c_{j} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i}$  for  $j \in F$ .)
$$= \sum_{i=1}^{m} \sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i}x_{j}$$

æ

$$T_{X} = \sum_{j \in R} c_{j}x_{j} + \sum_{j \in F} c_{j}x_{j}$$

$$\leq \sum_{j \in R} (\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij}y_{i})x_{j} + \sum_{j \in F} (\sum_{i=1}^{m} a_{ij}y_{i})x_{j}$$

$$(Since c_{j} \leq \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i} \text{ and } x_{j} \geq 0 \text{ for } j \in R$$

$$and c_{j} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i} \text{ for } j \in F.)$$

$$= \sum_{i=1}^{m} \sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij}y_{i}x_{j}$$

$$= y^{T}Ax$$

С

æ

 $x^T A y$ 

$$x^{T}Ay = \sum_{i \in I} (\sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij}x_{j})y_{i} + \sum_{i \in E} (\sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij}x_{j})y_{i}$$

2

◆□▶ ◆圖▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 三臣…

2

2

$$x^{T}Ay = \sum_{i \in I} (\sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij}x_{j})y_{i} + \sum_{i \in E} (\sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij}x_{j})y_{i}$$

$$\leq \sum_{i \in I} b_{i}y_{i} + \sum_{i \in E} b_{i}y_{i}$$
(Since  $\sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij}x_{j} \leq b_{i}$  and  $0 \leq y_{i}$  for  $i \in I$   
and  $\sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{ij}x_{j} = b_{i}$  for  $i \in E$ .
$$= \sum_{i=1}^{m} b_{i}y_{i}$$

$$= b^{T}y$$
.

2

Let  $g \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ .

2

Let  $g \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ .

**Question:** Does there exist  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  such that

$$0 \leq x$$
,  $g^T x < 0$ , and  $Ax = 0$ ?

2

Let  $g \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ .

**Question:** Does there exist  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  such that

$$0 \leq x$$
,  $g^T x < 0$ , and  $Ax = 0$ ?

We answer this question by considering the following LP.

minimize 
$$g^T x$$
  
subject to  $Ax = 0, 0 \le x$ .

æ

Let  $g \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ .

**Question:** Does there exist  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  such that

$$0 \leq x$$
,  $g^T x < 0$ , and  $Ax = 0$ ?

We answer this question by considering the following LP.

minimize 
$$g^T x$$
  
subject to  $Ax = 0, 0 \le x$ .

If the answer to the above question is Yes, then the optimal value in this LP is  $-\infty.$ 

3

ヘロン 人間 とくほ とくほ とう

Let  $g \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ .

**Question:** Does there exist  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  such that

$$0 \leq x$$
,  $g^T x < 0$ , and  $Ax = 0$ ?

We answer this question by considering the following LP.

minimize 
$$g^T x$$
  
subject to  $Ax = 0, 0 \le x$ .

If the answer to the above question is Yes, then the optimal value in this LP is  $-\infty$ .

What does this say about the dual to this LP?

General Duality Theory

3

The dual to the LP

maximize 
$$-g^T x$$
  
subject to  $Ax = 0, \ 0 \le x$ 

is

 $\begin{array}{ll} \text{minimize} & 0\\ \text{subject to} & A^T y \geq -g \end{array}$ 

What is the relationship between these two LPs?

æ

イロン イ団 とく ヨン イヨン

**Theorem:** Either there exists a solution  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  to the system

$$0 \leq x$$
,  $g^T x < 0$ , and  $Ax = 0$ 

or there exits a solution  $y \in \mathbb{R}^m$  to the system

$$0\leq g+A^T y,$$

but not both.

æ

イロン イ団 とく ヨン イヨン

#### Lemma:

Let  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  and  $b \in \mathbb{R}^m$ . Then either

there exists  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  such that  $0 \le x$  and Ax = b

or

there exists  $y \in \mathbb{R}^m$  such that  $0 \le A^T y$  and  $b^T y < 0$ , but not both.